

Report of Head of Projects and Programmes

Report to Chief Officer Asset Management and Regeneration

Date: 19th September 2019

Subject: Design and Cost Report for: Yeadon Town Hall – Backlog Maintenance Work - Capital Scheme Number 16996 YTH 000

Are specific electoral wards affected? If yes, name(s) of ward(s): Otley and Yeadon	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Has consultation been carried out?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Are there implications for equality and diversity and cohesion and integration?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Will the decision be open for call-in?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Does the report contain confidential or exempt information? If relevant, Access to Information Procedure Rule number : Appendix 1, of this report is confidential under Access to Information Procedure Rules 10.4 (3)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

Summary

1. Main issues

- Yeadon Town Hall is a Grade II Listed building in the centre of Yeadon. Following a condition survey in May 2017 and given the clear importance of the building as a Council managed heritage asset it is necessary to undertake maintenance and repair work appropriate to the building's listed status.
- The Council's Executive Board has approved injections into the capital programme (scheme no. 16996) of £13.8m to fund the maintenance of Council owned and managed buildings of heritage importance. Further injections of £2m in each financial year 2018/19, 2019/20 and 2020/2021 to address maintenance work defined in condition survey reports to be either Priority 1 (immediate) or Priority 2 (essential), and requiring attention within 18 months have also been made.
- To date expenditure of £5.3m has been committed from scheme no. 16996 on works to Lotherton Hall, repairs to the Victoria Hall at Leeds Town Hall, roof maintenance works at Leeds City Art Gallery and Leeds Central Library and, surveys of other heritage properties and associated fees.
- Funding of £8.5m remains for expenditure on Leeds Town Hall roof repairs, (currently on site) and other priority heritage projects to be brought forward.

- The Chief Officer Culture and Sport has previously approved the strategy for a procurement exercise to appoint a contractor to undertake immediate and essential maintenance works at Yeadon Town Hall. The works were subsequently competitively tendered through Constructionline as recommended by Procurement. This gave the City Council maximum flexibility in choosing appropriate and experienced Heritage Contractors to be included on the tender list.
- The evaluation of the tender submissions has now been concluded and Stone Edge Ltd. has been selected as the preferred bidder, with a tendered construction price of £430,210. Authority to Spend is therefore sought for the sum of £630,320 inclusive of fees and client contingency provision.

2. Best Council Plan Implications

- The project contributes to the City Priorities by reducing long-term revenue costs associated with repairs to the building.

3. Resource Implications

- The preferred bidder's tendered price is within the NPS pre-tender estimate for the proposed works.
- The Chief Officer Asset Management and Regeneration should note that the cost of the proposed work can be funded from existing Capital Scheme No. 16996.

Recommendations

The Chief Officer Asset Management and Regeneration is recommended to;

- a) Give Authority to Spend of £630,320 from existing budgetary provision, Capital Scheme No. 16996, for maintenance work to Yeadon Town Hall.
- b) Approve the appointment of Stone Edge Ltd. as the main contractor to carry out the proposed works to Yeadon Town Hall.
- c) Note the contract value with Stone Edge Ltd. will be £430,210.

1. Purpose of this report

The purpose of this report is;

- 1.1 To request Authority to Spend from the Chief Officer Asset Management and Regeneration the sum of £630,320 on maintenance works to Yeadon town Hall.
- 1.2 To seek approval from the Chief Officer Asset Management and Regeneration to appoint Stone Edge Ltd. as the principal contractor to carry out maintenance works to Yeadon Town Hall for the tendered sum of £430,210.

2. Background information

- 2.1 Since 2014 funding totalling £13.8m (rounded) has been injected into the Capital Programme (Scheme No. 16996) to address the specialist maintenance requirements of Council owned and managed buildings of heritage importance.
- 2.2 At the date of report preparation, £5.3m spend has been committed from Capital Scheme No. 16996. This has funded major roof maintenance works at Leeds Art Gallery and Leeds Central Library, repairs to the Victoria Hall roof at Leeds Town Hall, works at Lotherton Hall, and surveys of other heritage properties owned or managed by the Council.
- 2.3 An NPS Condition Survey on Yeadon Town Hall was carried out in May 2017 which identified the extent and cost of the maintenance works required to the Grade II Listed building.
- 2.4 The Chief Officer Asset Management and Regeneration should note that Planning Approval is not required for the proposed works. Listed Building Consent is required and it is anticipated this will be granted w/c 30th September 2019.
- 2.5 The procurement route to procure a suitable contractor, with an evaluation model of 60% of marks based on cost and 40% of the marks based on quality considerations was approved by the Chief Officer Culture and Sport in accordance with CPR 3.1.8 on 15 April 2019.

3. Main issues

3.1 Design Proposals and Full Scheme Description

The proposal outlined in this report is to carryout roofing work, re-fixing roof slates, ridges etc. general building work, timber conservation repairs and redecoration, replacing gutter and down pipes in cast iron, repairs to lead flashings, restoration work to the clock tower and of the clock faces and mechanisms, stone repairs and mortar repairs, window and doors repairs and redecoration, plaster and ceiling repairs, repairs to the mosaic flooring and minor structural works. Proposed mechanical works include replacing corroded radiators and removal of all lead pipework. The electrical works include, upgrading lighting and power, lightning protection extending fire circuits and additional protection, extending emergency lighting and removing redundant battery pack fittings.

- 3.2 NPS advise that on completion the proposed works will provide a design life of 50 years.
- 3.3 The strategic programme for the proposed works is summarised as follows:

Contract award 21st October 2019

Start on site 18th November 2019

Completion of works on site 13th July 2020

4. Corporate considerations

4.1 Consultation and engagement

- 4.1.1 The Executive Member for Learning, Skills and Employment has been consulted and is supportive of the proposed works at Yeadon Town Hall.
- 4.1.2 Ward Members have been informed and are supportive of the proposed works contained in the report.

4.2 Equality and diversity / cohesion and integration

- 4.2.1 An equality screening exercise has been carried out. The outcome is that an Equality Impact Assessment is not required for the approvals requested in this report.

4.3 Council policies and the Best Council Plan

4.3.1 Climate Emergency

Leeds City Council has recently declared a climate emergency. The work to be undertaken on this building, repairing the external envelope, making it wind and watertight, new energy efficient mechanical and electrical controls and the use of LED lighting throughout contribute to reducing the carbon footprint of the building.

- 4.3.2 The project contributes to the 2015-2020 City Priority of becoming a more efficient and enterprising Council, by reducing long-term revenue costs associated with repairs to the building.

4.4 Resources, procurement and value for money

- 4.4.1 Having regard to the nature of the proposed works, the programme constraints of the project, the Council's approach to risk transfer, and the desire as far as possible to achieve cost certainty, the procurement route was to appoint a contractor following a competition via Constructionline, providing the Council with maximum flexibility in selecting an appropriately qualified and experienced contractor used to working on heritage buildings.
- 4.4.2 The scoreable project specific questions to assess technical and professional ability were evaluated in accordance with the published documents by an evaluation panel of officers from Projects and Programmes Asset Management. NPS Leeds and officers from the Council's Procurement Service provided technical advice.
- 4.4.3 12 companies were invited to tender for the proposed works. 6 tenders were received and evaluated using a 60% price and 40% quality evaluation criteria model. The price evaluation was undertaken by NPS Leeds. Details of the price evaluations can be found in confidential Appendix 1, NPS Tender Analysis Report.
- 4.4.4 The evaluation panel assessed the quality submissions individually before meeting, with Procurement support, to arrive at a consensus score. The scoring criteria for quality and weightings included:
 - Managing the public interface

- Key issues when carrying out works to Grade 1 listed buildings
- Working within an operational building
- Security and water tightness
- Delivering to programme
- Stakeholder management
- Management of project risks
- Details of key staff for this project
- Employment and skills
- Health and safety
- Compliance with programme dates

4.4.5 A summary of the quality/price evaluation scores appear in the table below. Appendix 1 attached details the financial tender submissions.

Company	Quality Criteria	Price	Total Points	Rank
Stone Edge Ltd	345	600	945	1
Aspect Building Solutions Ltd	235	580.36	815.36	2
Aura Conservation Ltd	325	346.92	671.92	3
Bermar Building Co.	355	315	670	4
R N Wooler & Co.	non compliant	non compliant		
RDF Building	non compliant	non compliant		

4.4.6 The Chief Officer Asset Management and Regeneration should note that two bids were disqualified as their quality submissions were non-compliant.

4.4.7 The overall evaluation/due diligence process has not identified any significant risks in terms of awarding the contract to the successful bidder. All anomalies detected have been closed out and the tender was found to be arithmetically correct. The preferred contractor has the capacity, resources and experience to deliver the works.

4.4.8 Capital Funding and Cashflow

Previous total Authority to Spend on this scheme	TOTAL £000's	TO MARCH 2019 £000's	FORECAST				
			2019/20 £000's	2020/21 £000's	2021/22 £000's	2022/23 £000's	2023 on £000's
LAND (1)	0.0						
CONSTRUCTION (3)	0.0						
FURN & EQPT (5)	0.0						
DESIGN FEES (6)	0.0						
OTHER COSTS (7)	0.0						
TOTALS	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Authority to Spend required for this Approval	TOTAL £000's	TO MARCH 2019 £000's	FORECAST				
			2019/20 £000's	2020/21 £000's	2021/22 £000's	2022/23 £000's	2023 on £000's
LAND (1)	0.0						
CONSTRUCTION (3)	530.2		265.1	265.1			
FURN & EQPT (5)	0.0						
DESIGN FEES (6)	90.0		54.0	36.0			
P MAN COSTS (7)	10.1		6.1	4.0			
TOTALS	630.3	0.0	325.2	305.1	0.0	0.0	0.0
Total overall Funding (As per latest Capital Programme)	TOTAL £000's	TO MARCH 2019 £000's	FORECAST				
			2019/20 £000's	2020/21 £000's	2021/22 £000's	2022/23 £000's	2023 on £000's
LCC Funded	630.3		325.2	305.1			
Total Funding	630.3	0.0	325.2	305.1	0.0	0.0	0.0
Balance / Shortfall =	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0

4.5 Legal implications, access to information, and call-in

- 4.5.1 The approvals requested in this report are classed as a Key decision. The works are defined as category B maintenance works and expenditure and, can be approved by the Chief Officer Asset Management and Regeneration under the scheme of delegation. The report is eligible for Call-In.
- 4.5.2 This tender opportunity was conducted through an open competition via the Constructionline procurement process.
- 4.5.3 The tender has been evaluated in accordance with the evaluation criteria set out in the tender documents. In making the final decision, the Chief Officer Asset Management and Regeneration should be satisfied that awarding this contract represents best value.
- 4.5.4 Planning Approval is not required for the proposed works. Listed Building Consent is required and it is anticipated this will be granted w/c 30th September 2019.

4.5.5 Appendix 1 of this report is confidential under Access to Information Procedure Rules 10.4 (3) as it contains commercially sensitive information pertaining to the preferred bidder.

4.6 Risk management

4.6.1 A risk register was developed prior to tender and will be regularly updated with input from the preferred contractor once appointed.

4.6.2 There is a risk of damage to the contents and fabric of the building during the works. In mitigation the contractor was assessed on their approach to protecting the building and its contents, as part of the tender evaluation.

4.6.3 There is a risk that the cost of the proposed works may exceed the contractor's tendered submission. This risk will be mitigated through the operation of a rigorous change control process and the provision of a client contingency commensurate with the nature of the proposed works and the fact that the property is a Grade II Listed building.

5. Conclusions

5.1 Following a Condition Survey carried out on Yeadon Town Hall in May 2017 it is recommended that extensive maintenance and repair works are undertaken.

5.2 The procurement process undertaken has been in accordance with the Regulations and the Council's Contracts Procedure Rules with full support from Procurement and Commercial Services.

5.3 Following the quality/price tender evaluation, the bid submitted by Stone Edge Ltd is recommended for contract award and Authority to Spend £630,320 inclusive of fees and client contingency is sought. The cost of the proposed works can be funded from existing budget provision Capital Scheme No. 16996.

6. Recommendations

The Chief Officer Asset Management and Regeneration is recommended to;

6.1 Give Authority to Spend £630,320 from existing budgetary provision Capital Scheme No. 16996, for maintenance and work to Yeadon Town Hall.

6.2 Approve the appointment of Stone Edge Ltd as the main contractor to carry out the proposed works to Yeadon Town Hall.

6.3 Note the contract value with Stone Edge Ltd will be £430,210.

7. Background documents¹

7.1 None

¹ The background documents listed in this section are available to download from the council's website, unless they contain confidential or exempt information. The list of background documents does not include published works.